| **Student Name:** Marvis Leung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house supports the widespread adoption of progressive education |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  I think our opening is a bit too hyperbolic; I think we illustrate well how bad the situation is in the status quo - we could focus on the examples of how they study long hours, or are chained to desks, going to cram schools etc.  Set-up   * Huge humongous problem? * Clear framing on what is wrong with exams; are all of these specific to exams? * Clear explanation of your replacement by projects. Does the pressure to do well go away, regardless of the way in which teaching occurs? * Clear burden explanation. * Good variance in tone up top + pace.   Argument 1   * I think we want to explain why exams are such a big fixation. Why do we focus so much on them? Don’t just talk about general problems with exams, but how the values and norms in society mean that the structures and systems of traditional education are not recoverable. * Don’t say screwed up or screwed! Or cooked! * I think we’re underestimating how bad the real world gets. What’s the comparative? This is just an explanation as to why exams are bad. You need to be able to justify within the same refrain why a progressive model is better. In order to rebut your point, they just need to flip the utility of exams + the more extended world of traditional education; we do reduce it to exams pretty seriously.   Argument 2   * This entire argument is the comparative which is missing in the first argument. What is the way we measure what is and isn’t legitimate stress? We need to analyse what the purpose of schools and education is. * Why does mental health matter so much? Is there a mental health crisis in the status quo? * Is communication exclusive to your side? * Good work recognising that exams hurt some students - do we have a special duty or responsibility to them?   Don’t cut a POI off, we talked about this last week! Following the POI, the sense of control we were projecting over our language goes away a little. We also start using ‘uhhh’ and ‘umm’ frequently.  06:37 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Annabel Cheung |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house supports the widespread adoption of progressive education |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | **N/A** | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  This is a great opening! However, we need to make sure we vary our pace, especially in the opening. We speak a bit too fast. Even when we slow down and pause, we aren’t doing it for long enough. I also do think the opening preamble goes on for too long without a clear break to what you are saying - this is why post the hook, jump straight into signposting.  We need set-up! What is the system of education you support? We can also clarify how we recognize there are problems with the status quo and make necessary adjustments, such as mental health support and dealing with stress, but without this they get to push hard at this.  Rebuttal   * Fair on importance of dealing with stress; point out how specifically they have underrated how stressful actual life is, and a need for schools to fulfil their responsibility. * I think you should also point out that the pressures that come from Asian values are symmetric - parents now just focus on projects instead; explain why given this symmetrism, exams are better.   Argument 1   * Good on experiential learning at a lower level; the mech we have for older students not understanding is that they don’t have natural interest or attention. Explain this in greater detail! Good on sequential learning. Good on lack of structure. I think we also need to consider how the variance in implementation is likely to be across private and public schools; who has the funding to retrain teachers, how do kids pick themselves back up when teachers flunk out? Which side services children better?   Argument 2   * Start of this argument is repetitive. * You’re reading/sound like you are reading during this argument. * Why is there such a strong need for such strong kids? What does the real world require? What is this harshness? This is vague!   We need to vary our tone more! You varied your pace lots more today, but emphasis, modulation all still needed! The speech also went faster as it went on.  07:13 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Matias Li |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house supports the widespread adoption of progressive education |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69.5 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Good opening. I think neurodivergent kids matter very much in this debate, but is this what the debate winning or losing issue is at the moment? Or do you need to engage with what Annabel points out the biggest issue with progressive education is? The hook being relevant to the second speaker argument will always be slightly out of the debate, because it just hasn’t been talked about/clashed so far.  Rebuttal   * We’re misrepresenting Opp a little; they don’t think you’ll never go to science class, but they think, as the info-slide does, that this is about self guided learning. You can’t reject the burden the motion puts on your side! * Opp points out how stress is needed to survive in real life, and our 1st asks a POI related to exclusivity on this; we need to deal with this! * We aren’t evolving content beyond what Marvis said in response to the content on exams from Opp. * I think we want to explain why exams are such a big fixation. Why do we focus so much on them? Don’t just talk about general problems with exams, but how the values and norms in society mean that the structures and systems of traditional education are not recoverable in any way.   Argument 1   * It is not contentious that neuro-divergent students matter; explain instead HOW they get sidelined by the system. Explain what the impact of this is. * We need to explain why the schooling system needs to either prioritise these kids, or explain why this is just yet another stakeholder that gets hurt by traditional education. * We need to analyse the responsibility of schools and the state to these students. * Isn’t a lack of structure worse for neurodivergent students? This is an easy response to much of your argument! * We should explain how they are better off in the comparative; is it flexible learning pathways, having more autonomy? What is the mechanisation for this impact?   We need to vary our pace and modulate our tone more. We speak too slowly and are emphasising nearly every single word we do.  07:17 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Nathalie Ng |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house supports the widespread adoption of progressive education |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Don’t trade off neurodivergent kids - it’s a difficult trade off to make. Instead, focus on the exclusivity of help. We need to build a clear counter-model, where we explain how our side can mitigate stress or support neurodivergent kids. We can also clarify how we recognize there are problems with the status quo and make necessary adjustments, such as mental health support and dealing with stress, but without this they get to push hard at this.  Rebuttal - you need to tell me what they say, and then respond to it - these are just general rebuttals and summaries at this time!   * This is actually a fair answer on being results based! I think you should also point out that the pressures that come from Asian values are symmetric - parents now just focus on projects instead; explain why given this symmetrism, exams are better. * What is the unique value of exams, beyond the limited examples of sometimes at school and then in the workplace. * I think we can analyse how a lack of structure actually hurts students rather than helping them; push them to defend the full range of options in the info-slide, rather than just having ‘projects’. * Why is there no other way to learn stress? Good use of examples to show how adults are thrown with stress; but the POI Matias asks is legitimate, what is the relevance of this stress to other stress? * I think we also need to consider how the variance in implementation is likely to be across private and public schools; who has the funding to retrain teachers, how do kids pick themselves back up when teachers flunk out? Which side services children better?   Argument 1   * What is the unique thesis of this outcome? How is this different from what Annabel says/from your rebuttal? * The part on an unstructured environment is good, but we need to unpack what the purpose of schools is, and how the lack of standardisation means that it is impossible to achieve academic success. * Are we asking them to conduct field changing science research?   Our style was lots better today! We were more intentional with our emphasis, and sounded a lot more confident - well done!  Please don’t say ‘judge’ as much as you do!  07:18 | | | | | | |

| **Student Name:** Catherine Ho |
| --- |

| **Motion**: This house supports the widespread adoption of progressive education |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | **4** | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 69 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| Teacher comments:  Pick ONE of these problems and break it down. Explain HOW traditional education's emphasis on high-stakes testing and competition can contribute to student stress and anxiety. Progressive education, with its focus on individualised learning, reduced emphasis on standardised tests, and more flexible assessment methods, can create a less stressful learning environment. This can lead to improved mental well-being and a greater sense of psychological safety for students.  Clarifications:   * Fair on stress being accessible on your side. Explain why this is the sufficient and correct LEVEL of stress to have.   Clash 1:   * Good work identifying the outcome your side needs to achieve; analyse how both sides share outcomes; what is truly better for students, and then break it down. * I think we want to explain why exams are such a big fixation. Why do we focus so much on them? Don’t just talk about general problems with exams, but how the values and norms in society mean that the structures and systems of traditional education are not recoverable in any way. * Good on stakes - explain why low stakes matter so much. What is the purpose of school? What responsibility should educational institutes have to their students? * Tell me what the key take-away should be following the conclusion of the clash!   Clash 2   * This clarification should have come up way earlier! The POI is also very fair - you need to defend your burden of yes, shorter amounts of teaching time, but student autonomy and control is an important part of this. Explain why they need to be making these choices - and why they will make good decisions. * Why is stress so inherent to exams but not for projects? The delineation is unclear.   07:02  Better flow and concentration today! Keep the focus up. | | | | | | |